A Review of Cognitive and Behavioral Effects of Increased Carbon Dioxide Exposure in Humans

Aleksandra Stankovic, PhD
David Alexander, MD
Charles M. Oman, PhD
Jason Schneiderman, PhD

1Massachusetts Institute of Technology,
Department of Aeronautics and Astronautics
77 Massachusetts Ave, Cambridge, MA 02139

2National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Lyndon B. Johnson Space Center
Houston, Texas 77058

3KBRwyle
2400 NASA Parkway
Houston, TX 77058-2769

National Aeronautics and Space Administration

Johnson Space Center
Houston, Texas 77058

August 2016
Since its founding, NASA has been dedicated to the advancement of aeronautics and space science. The NASA scientific and technical information (STI) program plays a key part in helping NASA maintain this important role.

The NASA STI program operates under the auspices of the Agency Chief Information Officer. It collects, organizes, provides for archiving, and disseminates NASA’s STI. The NASA STI program provides access to the NASA Aeronautics and Space Database and its public interface, the NASA Technical Report Server, thus providing one of the largest collections of aeronautical and space science STI in the world. Results are published in both non-NASA channels and by NASA in the NASA STI Report Series, which includes the following report types:

- **TECHNICAL PUBLICATION.** Reports of completed research or a major significant phase of research that present the results of NASA Programs and include extensive data or theoretical analysis. Includes compilations of significant scientific and technical data and information deemed to be of continuing reference value. NASA counterpart of peer-reviewed formal professional papers but has less stringent limitations on manuscript length and extent of graphic presentations.

- **TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM.** Scientific and technical findings that are preliminary or of specialized interest, e.g., quick release reports, working papers, and bibliographies that contain minimal annotation. Does not contain extensive analysis.

- **CONTRACTOR REPORT.** Scientific and technical findings by NASA-sponsored contractors and grantees.

- **CONFERENCE PUBLICATION.** Collected papers from scientific and technical conferences, symposia, seminars, or other meetings sponsored or co-sponsored by NASA.

- **SPECIAL PUBLICATION.** Scientific, technical, or historical information from NASA programs, projects, and missions, often concerned with subjects having substantial public interest.

- **TECHNICAL TRANSLATION.** English-language translations of foreign scientific and technical material pertinent to NASA’s mission.

Specialized services also include creating custom thesauri, building customized databases, and organizing and publishing research results.

For more information about the NASA STI program, see the following:

- Access the NASA STI program home page at [http://www.sti.nasa.gov](http://www.sti.nasa.gov)
- E-mail your question via the Internet to help@sti.nasa.gov
- Fax your question to the NASA STI Help Desk at 443-757-5803
- Phone the NASA STI Help Desk at 443-757-5802
- Write to: NASA Center for AeroSpace Information 7115 Standard Drive Hanover, MD 21076-1320
A Review of Cognitive and Behavioral Effects of Increased Carbon Dioxide Exposure in Humans

Aleksandra Stankovic, PhD
David Alexander, MD
Charles M. Oman, PhD
Jason Schneiderman, PhD

1Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Department of Aeronautics and Astronautics
77 Massachusetts Ave, Cambridge, MA 02139

2National Aeronautics and Space Administration
Lyndon B. Johnson Space Center
Houston, Texas 77058

3KBRwyle
2400 NASA Parkway
Houston, TX 77058-2769

August 2016
TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 1

PHYSIOLOGICAL EFFECTS OF CO₂ EXPOSURE RISKS ................................................ 1

MOTIVATIONS .................................................................................................................... 2

METHODS .......................................................................................................................... 3

EFFECTS ON COGNITION AND PSYCHOMOTOR FUNCTIONING ................................ 3

EFFECTS ON SLEEP AND WAKEFULNESS ................................................................... 5

DISCUSSION ....................................................................................................................... 6

CONCLUSION ..................................................................................................................... 7

REFERENCES ..................................................................................................................... 8
(This page intentionally left blank.)
INTRODUCTION

Existing research has reliably demonstrated the respiratory and cardiovascular effects of carbon dioxide (CO₂) inhalation at moderately increased levels, with documented physiological changes to heart rate, blood pressure, tissue pH, and blood solubility (for a review of the human health risks of acute elevated CO₂ exposure, see Rice, 2004). Studies of indoor air quality have linked increased levels of ambient CO₂ with physiological symptoms such as headache, fatigue, and sore throat (Apte et al., 2000; Seppanen et al., 1999; Wargocki et al., 2000). High levels of CO₂ (35%) have reliably resulted in activation of the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenocortical (HPA) axis and subjective anxiety responses in healthy individuals (Argyropoulos et al., 2002), as well as panic attack-like symptoms (Colasanti et al., 2008; Griez et al., 2007) and experiences of physiological stress (Consolazio & Fisher, 1947; Kaye et al., 2004).

While significant neurological findings correspond to high levels of CO₂ exposure, less clinically significant cognitive effects may occur at a much lower level. These cognitive changes and the exposure thresholds at which they occur are less well established than their physiological counterparts; this paper, therefore, reviews the existing literature on the cognitive, neurological, and psychomotor effects of increased CO₂ exposure, with the objective of identifying research areas in which further investigation remains necessary.

In particular, this investigation is motivated by the chronic exposure to elevated ambient CO₂ concentrations experienced by astronauts aboard the International Space Station (ISS), and the CO₂ exposure-related symptoms that have been reported by astronauts on orbit (James, 2007; Law & Watkins, 2009). Such exposure may negatively affect crew health and operations, including mission safety and the successful completion of scientific goals.

PHYSIOLOGICAL EFFECTS OF CO₂ EXPOSURE

Carbon dioxide (CO₂) alters physiology in well-described ways terrestrially. In the bloodstream, CO₂ reacts with water to form carbonic acid (H₂CO₃), which then dissociates into bicarbonate (HCO₃⁻) and H⁺. The decrease in pH activates the medullary and peripheral arterial chemoreceptors, stimulating ventilation in the respiratory muscles and resulting in increased tidal volume and expiratory drive (SMAC, 1996).

CO₂ is also a potent vasodilator. As CO₂ levels rise to 3% (23 mm Hg), exercise tolerance decreases, while heart rate, blood pressure, and resting energy expenditures increase (Cooper, 1970). Early symptoms of exposure include air hunger and increased respiration.

Dizziness, headaches, and shortness of breath are also common. Exposure to higher CO₂ concentrations may result in confusion, heart palpitations, sweating, chest pain, anxiety, and panic attacks (Maresh, 1997; Beck, 1999; Woods, 1988). At levels as high as 10% (76 mm Hg) inhaled CO₂, severe dyspnea, vomiting, disorientation, and hypertension will develop, with prolonged exposure resulting in seizures and the eventual loss of consciousness (Cooper, 1970).
A rapid rise to 30% CO\textsubscript{2} (228 mm Hg) will result in acidosis, premature ventricular contractions, low or inverted P waves, increased T-wave voltages, and a marked increase in the QT interval (SMAC, 1996). Death has been reported at 20% to 22% CO\textsubscript{2} (152-168 mm Hg) (Dalgaard, 1972).

A single inhalation of 35% CO\textsubscript{2} reliably triggers the human stress system neuroendocrine response (HPA axis activation), as measured by plasma cortisol, cardiovascular change, and subjective anxiety responses in healthy participants (Argyropoulos et al., 2002).

Persistent, long-term health effects of acute high-level CO\textsubscript{2} exposure may include chronic headaches, vertigo, memory and concentration impairments, and poor sleep. Prolonged low-level CO\textsubscript{2} exposure, in turn, may lead to long-term negative effects on bone metabolism and related blood calcium concentrations (Rice, 2004).

**MOTIVATIONS**

Terrestrial levels of ambient CO\textsubscript{2} are about 0.03% by volume (0.23 mm Hg). These levels are chronically elevated on the ISS: typically, CO\textsubscript{2} concentrations aboard the ISS are about 0.5±0.2% (2.3-5.3 mm Hg), with large variations experienced; mean 7-day CO\textsubscript{2} levels have been recorded at 3.39 mm Hg, with a mean 7-day peak CO\textsubscript{2} level at 4.50 mm Hg (Law, 2014).

Assessing the cognitive and psychomotor effects of increased CO\textsubscript{2} has particular relevance for safety in spaceflight: in their review of challenges associated with psychosocial and neurobehavioral health in long-duration spaceflight, De La Torre et al. (2012) address the importance of cognitive functioning and the monitoring of decision-making in operational spaceflight.

In their 2009 paper, Law and Watkins discuss the physiological symptoms resulting from increased environmental exposure to CO\textsubscript{2} in spaceflight and the operational implications for crew biomedical health. Symptoms included headaches and lethargy, and findings were based largely on informal crew reporting. Individual predisposition to CO\textsubscript{2} retention and differences in adaptation to microgravity were identified as possible contributing factors to variability in symptom incidence; the authors also stressed the need for further research to review occupational limits for CO\textsubscript{2} exposure.

A review of the physiological effects of prolonged exposure (>30 days) to increased CO\textsubscript{2} concentrations did not produce findings useful for determining exposure standards or predicting inter-individual susceptibility (James & Macatangay, 2009; James, 2009). However, findings suggest that CO\textsubscript{2}-related symptoms may occur in spaceflight at lower concentrations than predicted by terrestrial studies, warranting further directed study of human performance effects of increased CO\textsubscript{2} exposure in microgravity (Cronyn et al., 2010).
METHODS
This review surveyed 75 research articles, identified through a keyword-driven literature search. Of the articles surveyed, 28 were identified as relevant to cognition (including memory, attention, reasoning, performance, and decision-making) and/or psychomotor functioning and 12 to sleep (including vigilance, alertness, and circadian effects of elevated CO₂ exposure); all others were limited to physiological effects, the vast majority of which included headache as a symptom. Research fields of the assessed articles spanned neuroscience, naval research, diving physiology, aviation, mountaineering, and medical sciences. Three articles pertained directly to CO₂ exposure effects observed in astronauts aboard the ISS.

The studies surveyed were categorized in 2 ways: exposure duration (“acute” or “chronic”) and relative level of increased exposure (“low,” “medium,” or “high”). “Acute” exposure was defined as a one-time or short-duration exposure (lasting less than 1 hour) to elevated levels of CO₂, whereas “chronic” exposure was defined as repetitive or prolonged inhalation at increased CO₂. The level of exposure was determined relative to the concentration range experienced on the ISS, to highlight which studies were methodologically most consistent with ISS levels of CO₂; in this respect, studies that assessed CO₂ concentrations up to 3% were designated “low” level (most operationally relevant), whereas studies with ranges from 3% to 10% were designated “medium,” and those above 10% were designated “high” (least operationally relevant); these designations will be referred to in the discussion of findings.

EFFECTS ON COGNITION AND PSYCHOMOTOR FUNCTIONING
Existing studies offer conflicting indications of CO₂ exposure effects on perception, motor functioning, and inhibitory control, as well as higher-order cognitive processes such as memory, concentration, decision-making, and task performance. Several studies point to decreased alertness and concentration following increased CO₂ exposure (Frey et al., 1998, low-chronic exposure category; Rice, 2004, medium-acute exposure category), and a decline in the visual perception of motion (Yang et al., 1997, low-acute exposure category).

In a diving chamber study, 4 participants experienced prolonged exposure (26 days) to modestly elevated ambient CO₂ (0.7% and 1.2% concentrations). Cognitive and visiomotor performance were assessed before, during, and after exposure; only visiomotor performance impairments were observed, although these effects may have been related to the time course of chamber adaptation (Manzey et al., 1995; Manzey & Lorenz, 1998).

Satish et al. (2012) have reported an association between increasing CO₂ concentrations and impairments in decision-making performance when healthy subjects were exposed to CO₂ at 0.06% (0.46 mm Hg), 0.1% (0.76 mm Hg), and 0.25% (1.9 mm Hg). Similarly, Sayers et al. (1987) noted that operational reasoning was significantly slower after acute exposure (20 min duration) to increased levels of CO₂ (at 4.5, 5.5, 6.5, or 7.5%); no impairments of short-term memory were seen, although increased irritability and discomfort were noted.
Environmental exposure to low levels of elevated CO₂ (at 550 ppm, 945 ppm, and 1400 ppm; low-chronic exposure level category) during the course of a full workday was found to impair performance on higher-order decision-making tasks, with higher levels of CO₂ related to greater decline in cognitive functioning (Allen et al., 2015); the exposure-response relationship between CO₂ level and cognitive performance in this study was found to be approximately linear across the experimental concentrations administered.

Fothergill et al. (1991) assessed cognitive and psychomotor performance at varying CO₂ concentrations at 1 and 6 atmospheres absolute (within the medium-acute exposure level category). Tasks used included a modified Stroop test, an arithmetic test, a number comparison task, and a figure-copying test. High CO₂ tension was found to significantly impair cognitive and psychomotor performance at both atmospheric levels.

Harter (1967), in an exploration of the potential effects of acute CO₂ exposure (5 min) on reaction time, found that reaction time decreased in the initial minutes of exposure; over time, however, reaction time increased with exposure time. Furthermore, reaction time impairment was found to be significantly greater for exposure to 7.9% CO₂ than for exposure to 0% to 5.5%. This study, however, found a high degree of individual variability in subject sensitivity to CO₂ effects, pointing to the importance of considering individual differences in response to CO₂ exposure.

Findings from a study conducted by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) in 2000 suggest that poor indoor air quality and higher levels of air pollutants may impair cognitive performance on mental tasks requiring concentration, calculation, or memory. In their examination of indoor air quality and student academic achievement, Bakó-Biró et al. (2012) demonstrated a decrease in cognitive task performance after exposure to elevated levels of ambient CO₂ (at the low-chronic exposure level category).

On the other hand, several investigations have contradicted these observations entirely, finding no consistent relationships between CO₂ exposure and either cognitive or motor functioning, in terms of speed, accuracy, or throughput (Bloch-Salisbury et al., 2000; Caretti, 1999; Frey et al., 1998; Garner et al., 2011; Henning et al., 2010; Selkirk et al., 2010; Sheehy et al., 1982; Vercruyssen, 1984; Vercruyssen et al., 2007).

In one study, while exposure to increased CO₂ predictably resulted in higher incidence of sore throats, nasal congestion, headaches, heightened pulse and breathing rate, and difficulty breathing, among other symptoms of physiological stress, no significant effects were seen on visual, auditory, or motor coordination performance (Consolazio & Fisher, 1947). In another investigation, intermittent exposure to 3% CO₂ across 6 days resulted in no significant changes in vigilance, eye-hand coordination, or problem-solving abilities (Weybrew, 1970).

In a 2-week bed rest study simulating CO₂ exposure (at about 5% concentration) in weightlessness, no detrimental effects were observed from bed rest or CO₂ exposure, either alone or in
combination, on complex tracking performance, hand-eye coordination, or problem-solving ability (Storm & Giannetta, 1974).

Bennett and colleagues (1985) assessed cognitive performance during arithmetic and reaction-time tasks in 14 male subjects during submarine confinement; no CO2-related findings emerged. End-tidal CO2 from a sample of Navy divers was correlated with cognitive performance (in terms of reaction time, visual scanning, visiospatial processing, and learning); no dose-related effects of CO2 were observed (Selkirk et al., 2010).

**EFFECTS ON SLEEP AND WAKEFULNESS**

Animal model studies have indicated an increase in sleep onset latency and a decrease in sleep duration in rats exposed to 6% to 8% CO2 for 2-3 hours, but no change in the percentage of sleep time spent in rapid eye movement (REM) sleep (Ioffe et al., 1984). Exposure to elevated CO2 resulted in no sleep phase delay in hamsters (Jarsky & Stephenson, 2000). The effects of modulated CO2 levels on sleep disruptions at high altitudes were also investigated using cats; only a decrease of CO2 levels below the normal concentration resulted in a detectable sleep effect, a lowered rate of REM (Lovering et al., 2003). Another cat study revealed that CO2 exposure at 6% resulted in a worsening of sleep parameters: the duration of wakefulness increased by 24.2%, while REM and non-REM (NREM) sleep decreased in both duration and frequency (Fraigne et al., 2008); however exposure to 2% inspired CO2 increased sleep duration and decreased wake time.

In humans, mild trends have been found in CO2 impact on sleep and arousal, with CO2 causing arousal from sleep (Ayas et al., 2000; Berry et al., 1993; Berthon-Jones & Sullivan, 1984) and increased alertness, orienting, and autonomic response (Garner et al., 2012); all these studies exposed participants to CO2 levels in the “medium” designation range.

Increased levels of ambient CO2 were not found to have a negative impact on general sleep quality. Sleep architecture, however, was somewhat altered: the amount of slow-wave sleep increased with the duration of CO2 exposure (Frey, 1998; Gundel et al., 1998a; both studies were conducted in the low exposure category).

A study examining prolonged exposure (across 24 days) to increased CO2 levels (in the low exposure category) via ambient environment found no significant sleep disruptions and no impairment of circadian functioning (Samel et al., 1998). In a series of studies conducted in a deep-diving chamber to investigate the effects of increased CO2 on metabolism, cardiorespiratory function, sleep, and circadian rhythms, physiological findings were consistent with typical somatic responses of headaches, increased vasodilation, and increased heart rate (Frey et al., 1998). Sleep quality was not significantly affected by ambient CO2 levels, although participants did report decreased alertness; however, accurate interpretation of these findings is limited by the small sample size (n=4). Exposure levels of CO2 approximated those experienced on the ISS.
DISCUSSION

This assessment of existing research into the psychomotor, cognitive, and sleep effects of elevated CO₂ exposure revealed conflicting, often contradictory findings. The majority of studies demonstrated no significant cognitive effects, although some results suggest mild impairments of psychomotor coordination, memory, and concentration. Additionally, some findings demonstrated no sleep impairments, while others showed disruptions of circadian functioning, hypervigilance, or changes in sleep architecture.

When taken together, the studies surveyed in this paper offered comprehensive assessments of cognitive functioning, including tasks of arithmetic, memory, pattern recognition, match-to-sample, logical reasoning, visual search, reaction time, and alertness. Of the 28 articles related to cognitive and/or motor functioning that were examined, 5 indicated impaired higher-order cognitive performance (including reasoning, memory, pattern recognition, and decision-making), while 6 demonstrated impairments of visiomotor coordination; 14 revealed no significant cognitive or psychomotor impact. Of the 11 articles that demonstrated statistically significant impacts of CO₂ exposure on cognition or motor functioning, 7 were in the “low” exposure designation category and therefore had greatest relevance to the operational conditions aboard the ISS. Of these 7 studies, 3 examined acute exposure and the other 4 chronic exposure; both of these categories of exposure duration are important for consideration in spaceflight, as astronauts may at various points experience elevated CO₂ levels either for a short duration or over a long period, and often repeatedly.

Of the 12 sleep-related articles, 3 indicated that arousal from sleep occurs during high CO₂ exposure, 2 pointed to lowered duration of REM, and 2 demonstrated no impact of elevated CO₂ levels on sleep or circadian functioning. Only 3 of the studies showing an effect on sleep, however, were in the operationally relevant “low” exposure range; all 3 of these studies examined effects of chronic (that is, prolonged and/or repeated) exposure to elevated CO₂.

The inconsistency in the literature regarding the cognitive and neuropsychological impacts of increased carbon dioxide exposure may be attributable in part to the wide variability in CO₂ exposure concentrations assessed, ranging from <1% in some studies to up to 35% in others. Additionally, the studies presented here employed a range of gas administration techniques. For example, Caretti (1999) induced heightened CO₂ exposure through a rebreather apparatus worn over the face, through which concentrations were manipulated directly, while Bakó-Biró (2012) monitored effects related to naturally fluctuating ambient levels of CO₂ over time within a confined indoor space. Furthermore, not all of these methods ensured consistent or controlled administration of CO₂ at particular concentrations for all participants.

At the same time, other factors inherent to this research limit the interpretability of cognitive effect findings; for instance, it is difficult to decouple the cognitive indications from purely physiological effects, since impairments in performance and decision-making may arise as secondary effects related to physiological experiences of headache and somatic stress.
CONCLUSION

While many studies have thus far addressed the impact of CO\textsubscript{2} concentration on cognition, the inconsistent and contradictory nature of current findings limits the ability to draw firm conclusions about the impact of elevated CO\textsubscript{2} exposure on sleep, cognition, and psychomotor performance. Further research, therefore, remains necessary to provide a clearer understanding of the risks of adverse cognitive and performance effects of acute and chronic high CO\textsubscript{2}, particularly at levels relevant to human spaceflight.

Additionally, this survey highlights the fact that the majority of existing studies focus solely on the physiological mechanisms (e.g., headaches, heightened heart rate) by which increased CO\textsubscript{2} exposure may impact cognition, but fail to consider the possibility that observed performance changes may in fact be attributable to changes in brain or muscle pO\textsubscript{2}, which covaries with pCO\textsubscript{2} in a way that may not be consistent across trials and individuals. A thorough examination, therefore, of the fluctuation of pO\textsubscript{2} as inspired CO\textsubscript{2} is manipulated remains critical if the impacts of elevated CO\textsubscript{2} exposure are to be decoupled from other physiological changes.

At the same time, this review demonstrated that limited research has, in fact, been done under environmental conditions analogous to those in operational spaceflight (that is, 0.3% to 0.7% ambient CO\textsubscript{2} exposure). Future investigations exploring more modest increases in CO\textsubscript{2} concentration during ambient exposure and incorporating manipulations such as head-down tilt (to induce fluid shifts associated with microgravity) or prolonged confinement could, therefore, greatly contribute to the establishment of appropriate operational limits and the development of countermeasure procedures for use in human spaceflight, and so are very much recommended given the findings of this survey.
REFERENCES


**Title:** A Review of Cognitive and Behavioral Effects of Increased Carbon Dioxide Exposure in Humans

**Authors:** Aleksandra Stankovic, David Alexander, Charles M. Oman, Jason Schneiderman

**Abstract:**
Existing research has reliably demonstrated the respiratory and cardiovascular effects of carbon dioxide (CO2) inhalation at moderately increased levels, with documented physiological changes to heart rate, blood pressure, tissue pH, and blood solubility. Studies of indoor air quality have linked increased levels of ambient CO2 with physiological symptoms such as headache, fatigue, and sore throat. High levels of CO2 have reliably resulted in activation of the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenocortical axis and subjective anxiety responses in healthy individuals, as well as panic attack-like symptoms and experiences of physiological stress. While significant neurological findings correspond to high levels of CO2 exposure, less clinically significant cognitive effects may occur at a much lower level. These cognitive changes and the exposure thresholds at which they occur are less well established than their physiological counterparts; this paper, therefore, reviews the existing literature on the cognitive, neurological, and psychomotor effects of increased CO2 exposure, with the objective of identifying research areas in which further investigation remains necessary. In particular, this investigation is motivated by the chronic exposure to elevated ambient CO2 concentrations experienced by astronauts aboard the International Space Station, and the CO2 exposure-related symptoms that have been reported by astronauts on orbit.